

Digitalization of Civil Service Performance Services in Grobogan Regency

Siti Marlina¹, Augustin Rina Herawati², Kismartini³

^{1,2,3}Universitas Diponegoro, Semarang, Indonesia

Email: sitimarlina1@students.undip.ac.id

Abstract

This article discusses the digitalization of performance services for State Civil Apparatus employees at the Regional Personnel Education and Training Agency of Grobogan Regency. Digitalization of performance services is needed to follow up on Grobogan Regent Regulation Number 40 of 2019 concerning Electronic-Based Government System Governance (SPBE). In implementing the digitalization of performance services for State Civil Apparatus employees in the Grobogan Regency, problems are still found in performance assessments that are less objective and not in line with organizational assessments. The theory used is the successful elements of digitalization from Indrajit (2006), which consists of Support, Capacity and Value with qualitative research methods to obtain data. The results of the study show that the support of the Grobogan Regency Government is not optimal because it does not yet have a Regent Regulation that regulates performance assessments using the e-Kinerja application. In addition, from the capacity aspect, there is still a lack of supporting devices in the form of computers in the field of apparatus performance assessments and awards at the Regional Personnel Education and Training Agency of Grobogan Regency. From the Value aspect, the benefits felt by the government and State Civil Apparatus at the Regional Education and Training Personnel Agency have been widely felt, especially for employees with functional positions who have been facilitated in managing their credit score assessments through the e-Kinerja application. Based on these findings, it can be concluded that the implementation of digitalization of State Civil Apparatus employee performance services at the Regional Education and Training Personnel Agency in Grobogan Regency is not yet optimal in terms of support and capacity because problems related to the legal basis and lack of information technology infrastructure are still found.

Keywords: *Digitalization, Performance Services, State Civil Apparatus.*



A. INTRODUCTION

In facing the current global conditions, the use of information and communication technology in governance is an unavoidable necessity. The process of globalization that is inseparable from modern society today requires the government to be more open, effective, efficient, transparent and accountable in carrying out its duties in providing access to information related to government so that it can accelerate the government in implementing good governance (Amri et al., 2022). To realize clean, effective, transparent and accountable governance as well as quality and reliable public services, an electronic-based government system or e-government is needed. E-Government refers to the use of information technology for various government services (Malodia et al., 2021). The use of e-government by the government aims to provide information and services to its citizens, business affairs, or other matters relating to government that are applied to the legislature, judiciary

or public administration to increase internal efficiency, deliver public services or democratic governance processes (Indrawan et al., 2022).

Digitalization is the main thing to increase efficiency in the public sector (Stoica & Radu, 2023). The implementation of e-Government services or SPBE is not only understood as a form of transferring the work of government agencies from manual work systems to computerized or digital/online systems, but philosophically the implementation of e-Government is a form of bureaucratic work that dynamically experiences distortion in the external environment of the organization or demands that require a change (Klochan et al., 2021). The implementation of the Electronic-Based Government System (SPBE) is a change in the mindset of the bureaucracy which has so far seemed slow, rigid and has many loopholes and application systems that have not been integrated.

The SPBE evaluation in Indonesia was first carried out in 2018, in line with systematic efforts to implement SPBE based on Presidential Regulation (Perpres) Number 95 of 2018. With ongoing evaluation, it is hoped that government agencies can be more responsive to employee challenges and needs, and be able to optimize services based on information technology. In the last three years, the National SPBE index has increased every year. The following is the National SPBE index data for 2021-2023:

Table 1. National SPBE Index 2021-2023

No	Year	SPBE Index
1	2021	2.24
2	2022	2.34
3	2023	2.79

Source: Ministry of State Apparatus Utilization and Bureaucratic Reform

Based on table 1, it can be seen that the national SPBE index continues to increase from 2021-2023. In 2021, the national SPBE index achieved was 2.24 on a scale of 5. In 2022, the achievement of the national SPBE index increased to 2.34 and continued to increase to 2.79 in 2023. The increase in the achievement of the SPBE index shows that the government has a strong commitment to improving the quality of public services which is the main objective of implementing SPBE. The achievement of the national SPBE cannot be separated from the efforts to improve SPBE in the provincial and regional governments.

Central Java Province in 2023 achieved the highest SPBE index achievement at the provincial level. The SPBE Index of the Central Java Provincial Government has continued to increase in the last three years. In 2021, the SPBE index of Central Java Province was 2.74, then in 2022 it increased to 3.34 and in 2023 it increased again to 4.26 on a scale of 5. The SPBE achievement of the Central Java Provincial Government in 2023 received the Digital Government Award from President Joko Widodo as the Province with the highest SPBE index. This achievement reflects the commitment of the regional government in implementing information and communication technology to improve public services.

Central Java Province consists of 6 former residency areas, namely the former Banyumas residency, the former Kedu residency, the former Pati residency, the former Pekalongan residency, the former Semarang residency and the former Surakarta residency. The areas around the Central Java provincial government are included in the former Semarang residency which consists of 2 cities and 4 regencies, namely Semarang City, Salatiga City, Demak Regency, Grobogan Regency, Semarang Regency, and Kendal Regency. Based on the results of the SPBE evaluation of the local government, the following is the SPBE achievement data in the former Semarang Residency in 2021-2023:

Table 2. SPBE Achievement Data in the Former Semarang Residency 2021-2023

No	Name of Institution	Index			Information
		2021	2022	2023	
1	Semarang City Government	2.98	3.38	3.89	Improvement
2	Demak Regency Government	3.19	3.50	3.62	Improvement
3	Grobogan Regency Government	2.51	3.37	3.37	Stagnant in the last 2 years
4	Salatiga City Government	2.34	2.84	3.26	Improvement
5	Semarang Regency Government	2.36	2.13	3.26	Improvement
6	Kendal Regency Government	3.27	2.93	2.95	Decrease in 2022, increase in 2023

Source: Ministry of State Apparatus Utilization and Bureaucratic Reform

Based on table 2 above, it can be seen that Semarang City, Demak Regency, Salatiga City, Semarang Regency and Kendal Regency have experienced an increase in SPBE achievements in the last year. A different thing can be seen in the SPBE achievements of the Grobogan Regency Government which did not experience an increase in 2023. This shows that in 2023 efforts to increase SPBE in the Grobogan Regency Government have not been running optimally due to the stagnant SPBE index achievement.

One of the electronic-based government administration services implemented by the Grobogan Regency Government is employee performance services. Employee performance is an important factor for an organization because it has a direct impact on the success of the organization (Onyango & Ondiek, 2021). Employee performance is part of the manifestation of work carried out by an employee which is usually carried out as a basis or reference for assessing employees in an organization (Latifah et al., 2023). Digitalization and digital transformation contribute to improving performance and efficiency in the public sector (Androniceanu, 2023; Egorova et al., 2021).

Based on the results of the evaluation of the Grobogan Regency merit system in 2023, the Grobogan Regency Government received notes from KASN to improve the objectivity of the performance assessment method. The performance assessment implemented by the Grobogan Regency Government is considered less objective because it has not accommodated a 360-degree work behavior assessment, where

colleagues and subordinates can provide employee behavior assessments. The problem of performance management through the e-Performance application in Grobogan Regency is also still visible in the Regional Education and Training Personnel Agency as the leading sector of ASN management in Grobogan Regency.

Based on the Circular of the Minister of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform Number 3 of 2023 concerning the procedures for determining the performance predicate of ASN employees, the achievement of organizational performance will determine the distribution pattern of performance predicates below it. If the organizational performance predicate is "Good", then most (maximum 70%) of employees have a Good performance predicate, and the others get a Very Good or Less predicate. In 2023, the BKPPD of Grobogan Regency. Grobogan achieved a "Good" organizational performance achievement, but the results of the ASN employee performance assessment at the Grobogan Regency BKPPD on the e-Kinerja application did not show any variation in the assessment, all employees received a Good predicate on the performance assessment documented in the e-Kinerja application. This can be seen in the following data:

Table 4. 2023 Grobogan Regency BKPPD ASN Employee Performance Assessment Data on eKinerja

Performance Assessment Results	Number of Employees
Very Good	0
Good	48
Need Improvement	0
Poor	0
Very Poor	0

The data in table 4 above shows that the results of the performance assessment of all ASN employees at the BKPPD of Grobogan Regency at the beginning of the use of the e-Performance application in 2023 were Good. The absence of variation in the assessment indicates that the assessment method applied by the Grobogan Regency Government in the e-Performance application is less objective and does not match the proportion of employee assessments based on the results of organizational assessments.

Based on this background, it can be seen that the digitalization of ASN employee performance services in Grobogan Regency has not been running optimally. Referring to this background, the research problem that will be analyzed is "how is the implementation of digitalization of ASN employee performance services in Grobogan Regency?". For this reason, this study aims to examine the implementation of digitalization of ASN employee performance services in Grobogan Regency. The results of this study are expected to provide constructive recommendations for local governments, especially Grobogan Regency in increasing the effectiveness and efficiency of ASN employee performance management through digitalization.

Previous research conducted by Nada & Mursyidah (2022) in their research entitled "Effectiveness of Electronic Performance (e-Performance) at the Regional Civil Service Agency (BKD) of Sidoarjo Regency" examined e-performance from an effectiveness perspective. (Egorova et al., 2021) in their research entitled "Digitalization of public procurement in the Russian Federation: Case study" examined the implementation of e-Performance from a service quality perspective in order to improve employee performance. (Plesner & Justesen, 2022) with the title "The double darkness of digitalization: Shaping digital-ready legislation to reshape the conditions for public-sector digitalization". This research examines the digitalization of population document services in Semarang Regency and is an electronic-based public service. The novelty of this research lies in the focus of the research related to the implementation of digitalization of Civil Service employee performance services which are electronic-based government administration services with government officials as service users and are studied from an e-government perspective.

This study was analyzed with the theory (Indrajit, 2006) from the Harvard JFK School of Government, there are three key elements of success that are important and must be given serious attention in implementing digitalization concepts in the public sector, namely: 1) Support, including indicators of recognition of the basis of e-government, allocation of resources (human, financial, time, and information), development of supporting infrastructure and superstructure, and delivery of the concept of digitalization as a whole; 2) Capacity, including indicators of resource allocation, infrastructure and availability of competent human resources; and 3) Value, benefits for the government and service users.

B. METHOD

This research aims at exploring and describing social situations comprehensively and in-depth. The type of approach that will be used in this study is a qualitative approach aimed at describing and analyzing phenomena, events, social activities, attitudes, beliefs, perceptions and thoughts of humans individually and in groups (Ghony & Almanshur, 2012). Data collection will be carried out through interviews, observations and documentation studies. This research was conducted with a qualitative approach to analyze the implementation of digitalization of ASN employee performance services in Grobogan Regency. This study uses qualitative descriptive data obtained through field observations and interviews. The determination of research informants is based on the parties or stakeholders involved in the implementation of digitalization of ASN employee performance management services at the Grobogan Regency Regional Education and Training Personnel Agency. The selection of informants uses the basis of purposive sampling techniques. Purposive sampling is a data source sampling technique with certain considerations.

C. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

In the digitalization of civil servant performance services in Grobogan Regency, it is necessary to seriously apply e-government concepts so that they can be

implemented properly. According to Indrajit (2016) from the Harvard JFK School of Government, three key elements of success are important and must be given serious attention in implementing digitalization in the public sector, namely:

First, support, which is the first and most crucial element that the government must have, is the desire of various public and political officials to truly implement the concept of e-government, not just following trends or opposing initiatives related to e-government principles. The expected support includes recognition of the basis of e-government, allocation of resources (human, financial, time, and information), development of supporting infrastructure and superstructures, and delivery of the concept of digitalization (Androniceanu, Georgescu, & Sabie, 2022; Hammerschmid et al., 2024).

The implementation of performance services through e-Kinerja in Grobogan Regency is an implementation of Grobogan Regent Regulation Number 40 of 2019 concerning SPBE governance. Technically, there are no specific rules that can be used as guidelines for the use of e-Kinerja in ASN employee performance services in Grobogan Regency. The support of the Grobogan Regency Government is not yet strong enough for the implementation of employee performance services through the e-Kinerja application, because it is not yet supported by regional regulations. The allocation of resources including human, financial, time and information to support the use of e-Kinerja has begun to be given attention. The allocation of human resources can be seen from the existence of e-Kinerja admins and the allocation of staff in the field of apparatus performance assessment and awards who take care of e-Kinerja. The allocation of the budget can be seen from the 2023 budget implementation document which allocates a budget for socialization related to e-Kinerja which is then shared via BKPPD YouTube and Instagram.

Support for infrastructure provided by the Grobogan Regency BKPPD to support the implementation of digitalization of employee performance services through e-Kinerja is already well available. However, the facilities available at the Grobogan Regency BKPPD such as laptops/PCs are not evenly distributed to all staff, as seen in the BKPPD Civil Service Performance Assessment and Awards Division where there are still 3 staff who have not received laptop/PC facilities. The layout of the civil service performance assessment and awards division, which includes a team that manages employee performance services, is adequate. This is indicated by the room being kept clean and looking conducive. One table with another table also has space so that it does not look cramped and messy and employees can feel comfortable in completing their work. With this, it can be seen that the infrastructure that supports the implementation of digitalization of ASN employee performance services through the e-Kinerja application is adequate, but it still needs to be considered for staff who have not received laptop/PC facilities. The condition of the room in the division that handles the use of the e-Kinerja application also looks clean and conducive, indicating that the room is quite adequate.

The legal basis becomes a superstructure in the implementation of digitalization of ASN employee performance services through e-Kinerja which has

been presented in the previous discussion, namely Grobogan Regent Regulation Number 40 of 2019 concerning Electronic-Based Government System Governance (SPBE). In its management, e-Kinerja is managed by an admin with a computer administrator position in the Civil Service Performance Assessment and Awards Sector. Employee performance services contained in the e-Kinerja application include performance planning, performance monitoring, performance coaching and performance assessment.

The performance planning process is carried out by ASN employees with their direct superiors, then performance monitoring is carried out by direct superiors, performance coaching is carried out by direct superiors by utilizing e-Kinerja in the form of coaching, mentoring and counseling and performance assessments are carried out by direct superiors by providing feedback on employee performance on the e-Kinerja application. In its formation, the e-Kinerja application was formed by the central BKN, but for management in Grobogan Regency it was carried out by the Civil Service Performance Assessment and Awards Division of the Grobogan Regency BKPPD which consisted of 9 employees.

The use of e-Kinerja in Grobogan Regency began with the implementation of socialization to ASN in Grobogan Regency so that ASN employees know that employee performance services can be carried out paperless through e-Kinerja. The socialization was carried out in a hybrid manner by inviting participants directly and via zoom and BKPPD YouTube. The socialization was carried out by inviting speakers from BKN who conveyed the use and utilization of the e-Kinerja application in managing ASN employee performance.

Second, capacity is the ability or empowerment of the local government in realizing the implementation of digitalization. In this case, there are three indicators, namely adequate resource allocation, availability of information technology infrastructure, and availability of human resources with the required competencies and expertise (Androniceanu, Georgescu, & Kinnunen, 2022; Fauzi, 2023).

In the implementation of digitalization of ASN employee performance services in Grobogan Regency, sufficient financial resources are needed to run e-Performance services. Budget support is needed in the implementation of the socialization of the use of e-Performance. In 2023, the socialization of e-Performance was carried out with a budget allocated for the sub-activity of implementing the assessment and evaluation of the performance of the apparatus in the field of assessment of the performance of the apparatus and awards of the Grobogan Regency BKPPD. The budget used to support the digitalization of employee performance services comes from the Grobogan Regency Regional Revenue and Expenditure Budget (APBD) which is contained in the Budget Implementation Document (DPA) of the Grobogan Regency BKPPD for 2023 and 2024.

Information technology infrastructure is needed to support the implementation of employee performance service digitalization in Grobogan Regency. The supporting devices used are computers, scanners and internet networks. In the field of e-Performance management at BKPPD Grobogan, there is

still a shortage of computer devices due to the addition of new employees. Meanwhile, scanners are already available and the internet network is good in every room at BKPPD. The availability of adequate human resources is crucial in the operationalization of performance service digitalization. The availability of human resources with the required competencies and expertise is an important aspect so that the implementation of employee performance service digitalization can be in accordance with the expected benefits. For e-Performance, it is managed by the apparatus performance assessment and awards sector consisting of a head of division, 2 functional employees and 6 implementing employees.

Third, the value that sees the benefits of implementing digitalization, both for the government and ASN as service users. The implementation of digitalization will not be useful if there are no parties who feel they are benefiting. ASN employees as service users have several advantages to the e-Kinerja application. In addition to service users, the benefits of e-Kinerja are also obtained by agencies. BKPPD feels the benefits of using e-Kinerja because in managing employee performance in its environment it becomes easier, more effective, more efficient and accountable. Other personnel processes such as managing promotions are also faster because performance assessment documents are integrated with SIASN as a digital service to apply for promotions.

Research on the digitalization of civil servant (ASN) performance services at the Regional Education and Training Personnel Agency (BKPPD) of Grobogan Regency found that although the value elements of the implementation of digitalization, such as the e-Kinerja application, have provided benefits for agencies, work units, and employees, the support and capacity elements are still not optimal. These results can be compared with various previous studies related to e-government in the public sector, especially in developing countries.

One of the important findings of this study is the weak support from the Grobogan Regency Government. Based on the concept of e-government proposed by Indrajit (2016), support is a key element that includes policy and regulatory support from the government. In Grobogan Regency, there is no regent regulation that specifically regulates employee performance assessments using the e-Kinerja application, and this will certainly hinder the digitalization process because without strong legal support, the implementation of technology often does not get the legitimacy or political support needed. This finding is in line with a study by (Trischler & Westman Trischler, 2022), which states that lack of policy support is one of the main causes of e-government project failure in various regions in Indonesia. (Dobrolyubova, 2021) research also highlights the importance of regulatory support in ensuring the success of digital transformation in the public sector, especially in developing countries, where the implementation of technology often faces bureaucratic and regulatory challenges.

Capacity elements that include technological infrastructure and organizational capacity are also problems in this study. It was found that in the BKPPD of Grobogan Regency, the field of apparatus performance assessment and awards still lacks

hardware, such as PCs, which hinders the digitalization process. This finding echoes studies by (Armenia et al., 2021) and (Androniceanu, 2023), which found that the lack of technological infrastructure is one of the main obstacles to implementing e-government in many regions. In Indonesia, this problem is very common, especially in less developed areas, where technological capacity such as internet networks, hardware, and human resources are still limited. Without adequate capacity, technology cannot be implemented properly, which has an impact on the quality of services provided.

This study shows that the e-Kinerja application has provided significant benefits for various parties in Grobogan Regency in terms of value. ASN feels an increase in efficiency in performance assessments, as well as better transparency in human resource management. Previous studies, such as those conducted by (van Kersbergen & Tinggaard Svendsen, 2024), revealed that one of the main benefits of e-government is increased efficiency, transparency, and accountability. This is also supported by (Burlacu et al., 2021) which found that digitalization in the public sector can reduce administrative costs and improve employee performance. The finding that the value element has provided positive results in Grobogan Regency shows that, although there are still shortcomings in support and capacity, the benefits of digitalization are beginning to be felt, if the support and capacity elements are not immediately improved, the full potential of digitalization may not be achieved.

The results of this study confirm that the main challenges in implementing digitalization in the Grobogan Regency are by findings in other developing regions. The absence of regulations that support e-Kinerja applications reflects a common gap in the process of adopting technology in government, as expressed by (Agostino et al., 2022). Strong policy support must be provided immediately, for example, by issuing a regent regulation that specifically regulates the use of e-Kinerja to strengthen the legitimacy and sustainability of this program.

Capacity deficiencies must be addressed by improving existing infrastructure and technology. The Grobogan Regency Government needs to invest more in hardware procurement and human resource training to optimise the e-Kinerja application. (Di Giulio & Vecchi, 2023) study emphasized that adequate technological capacity is an important foundation for implementing effective e-government. Without this capacity, digital technology will be challenging to implement properly, and its benefits will be limited.

Although this study found that the value element of the implementation of digitalization has produced positive results, full success will only be achieved if the support and capacity elements are improved. The Grobogan Regency Government needs to take further steps to overcome these obstacles so that the digitalization of ASN employee performance services can run more effectively and provide long-term benefits. This study also provides implications for other regions that are adopting e-government, namely the importance of policy support and increasing technological capacity to ensure the success of digital transformation.

The digitalization of civil servant (ASN) performance services in Grobogan Regency faces several factors that play an important role in determining its success or failure. Based on research findings, policy support is the main factor influencing the success of digitalization in Grobogan. The lack of specific regulations governing the use of e-Kinerja applications, such as regent regulations, creates obstacles in implementation. The inability of local governments to provide a strong legal basis makes this digitalization initiative lack sufficient legitimacy. Clear policies and regulations are needed to ensure that digital innovations are accepted and complied with by all stakeholders, and the absence of strong policy support risks slowing down or even thwarting digitalization efforts (Androniceanu & Georgescu, 2023; Chaitra et al., 2023).

Other factors that influence are technological capacity and human resources. This study revealed that in the Regional Education and Training Personnel Agency (BKPPD) of Grobogan Regency, the availability of technological infrastructure, such as PCs to support the e-Kinerja application, is still limited. Lack of hardware and lack of training for employees in utilizing this new system slows down the digitalization process. Inadequate technological infrastructure and employee digital competence capacity are common obstacles in many digitalization projects in the public sector, especially in less developed areas. Failure to build this capacity can cause difficulties in technology integration and hinder the effectiveness of the services provided (Criado, 2021; Krejnus et al., 2023).

The benefits or value of the e-Kinerja application have begun to be felt by various parties. Digitalization has provided benefits in increasing the efficiency of employee performance assessments, creating better transparency, and accelerating the administration process at the work unit level. This shows that even though there are obstacles in the aspects of support and capacity, the implementation of digitalization is still able to provide positive results in several aspects. Another success factor is employee acceptance of the new system. Along with the implementation of the e-Kinerja application, employees began to feel direct benefits in their work. The positive acceptance and use of this digital system by employees is an indicator that this technology is able to provide a more efficient solution compared to the previous manual method, this is an important element in the success of digitalization, where technology adoption by users is the key to the success of the transformation.

The main failure factors of digitalization in Grobogan Regency are rooted in weak policy support and inadequate infrastructure, while success factors are related to the clear benefits of the digital system and good acceptance from employees. In order for this digitalization process to be fully successful, the Grobogan Regency Government needs to strengthen policy support and improve the technological capacity and skills of human resources. Without these steps, digitalization success will be difficult to achieve, and the potential for failure will continue to haunt digital transformation efforts in the region (Fischer et al., 2021; Mynenko & Liulov, 2022).

D. CONCLUSION

In the implementation of digitalization of civil servant performance services at the Grobogan Regency Regional Personnel Education and Training Agency based on e-government concepts from Indrajit (2016) which mentions elements of success in the form of support, capacity and value, there are still several things that have not run optimally. From the support indicator, support from the Grobogan Regency Government is not yet very strong because there is no Grobogan regent regulation that specifically regulates performance assessments using the e-Performance application. From the capacity indicator, the Grobogan Regency Government, especially at the Regional Personnel Education and Training Agency, still lacks supporting devices in the form of PCs in the field of civil servant performance assessments and awards as the field that handles employee performance assessments. Furthermore, based on the value indicator, the use of e-Performance has provided benefits to agencies, work units and employees as service users. Based on the results of the research findings, it shows that the support indicator as the main thing that must be met for the implementation of digitalization of ASN employee performance services at the Grobogan Regency BKPPD is still not optimal. The Grobogan Regency Government needs to study in more depth the support from the Government based on legal aspects to strengthen the implementation of digitalization of ASN employee performance services in Grobogan Regency.

REFERENCES

1. Agostino, D., Saliterer, I., & Steccolini, I. (2022). Digitalization, accounting and accountability: A literature review and reflections on future research in public services. *Financial Accountability & Management*, 38(2), 152–176.
2. Amri, U., Adiando, A., & As'ari, H. (2022). Kebijakan Inovasi dalam Penyelenggaraan Sistem Pemerintahan Berbasis Elektronik (SPBE) di Kota Dumai. *Jurnal Pendidikan Tambusai*, 6(2), 12201–12207.
3. Androniceanu, A. (2023). The new trends of digital transformation and artificial intelligence in public administration. *Revista» Administratie Si Management Public «(RAMP)*, 40, 147–155.
4. Androniceanu, A., & Georgescu, I. (2023). Public Administration Digitalization and Government Effectiveness in the EU Countries. *Cent. Eur. Pub. Admin. Rev.*, 21, 7.
5. Androniceanu, A., Georgescu, I., & Kinnunen, J. (2022). Public administration digitalization and corruption in the EU member states. A comparative and correlative research analysis. *Transylvanian Review of Administrative Sciences*, 18(65), 5–22.
6. Androniceanu, A., Georgescu, I., & Sabie, O.-M. (2022). The impact of digitalization on public administration, economic development, and well-being in the EU countries. *Cent. Eur. Pub. Admin. Rev.*, 20, 9.

7. Armenia, S., Nunzio, C., Gnan, L., & Flamini, G. (2021). A systems approach to the digital transformation of public administration. *Prospettive in Organizzazione*, 14.
8. Burlacu, S., Popescu, M. L., Diaconu, A., & Sârbu, A. (2021). Digital Public Administration for Sustainable Development. *European Journal of Sustainable Development*, 10(4), 33.
9. Chaitra, M. S., Robin, I. A. M., Martha, Y. F., & Darmawan, I. (2023). Penerapan e-Government dalam Upaya Meningkatkan Kualitas Pelayanan Publik di Kota Bandung. *Madani: Jurnal Ilmiah Multidisiplin*, 1(11).
10. Criado, J. I. (2021). Digital public administration in Latin America: Digitalization, public innovation, and the future of technologies in the public sector. In *The Emerald Handbook of Public Administration in Latin America* (pp. 343–374). Emerald Publishing Limited.
11. Di Giulio, M., & Vecchi, G. (2023). Implementing digitalization in the public sector. Technologies, agency, and governance. *Public Policy and Administration*, 38(2), 133–158.
12. Dobrolyubova, E. (2021). Measuring outcomes of digital transformation in public administration: Literature review and possible steps forward. *NISPAcee Journal of Public Administration and Policy*, 14(1), 61–86.
13. Egorova, M., Andreeva, L., Andreev, V., Tsindeliani, I., & Kikavets, V. (2021). Digitalization of public procurement in the Russian Federation: Case study. *Nispacee Journal of Public Administration and Policy*, 14(1), 87–106.
14. Fauzi, A. (2023). Pengaruh Coaching Dan Mentoring Terhadap Kinerja Pegawai. *Jurnal Akuntansi Dan Manajemen Bisnis*, 3(1), 121–126.
15. Fischer, C., Heuberger, M., & Heine, M. (2021). The impact of digitalization in the public sector: A systematic literature review/Die Auswirkungen von Digitalisierung im öffentlichen Sektor: Ein systematischer Literaturüberblick. *Dms–Der Moderne Staat–Zeitschrift Für Public Policy, Recht Und Management*, 14(1), 3–4.
16. Ghony, M. D., & Almanshur, F. (2012). Metodologi penelitian kualitatif. *Jogjakarta: Ar-Ruzz Media*, 61, 177–181.
17. Hammerschmid, G., Palaric, E., Rackwitz, M., & Wegrich, K. (2024). A shift in paradigm? Collaborative public administration in the context of national digitalization strategies. *Governance*, 37(2), 411–430.
18. Indrajit, R. E. (2006). *Electronic Government: Konsep Pelayanan Publik Berbasis Internet dan Teknologi Infromasi*. Yogyakarta: Andi.
19. Indrawan, I., Yuliani, F., & Tua, H. (2022). Implementasi Elektronik Government (E-Gov) dalam Meningkatkan Kinerja Pegawai di Kecamatan Dumai Kota. *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Konseling (JPDK)*, 4(6), 4771–4777.
20. Klochan, V., Piliaiev, I., Sydorenko, T., Khomutenko, V., Solomko, A., & Tkachuk, A. (2021). Digital Platforms as a tool for the transformation of strategic Consulting in Public Administration. *Journal of Information Technology Management*, 13(Special Issue: Role of ICT in Advancing Business and Management), 42–61.

21. Krejnus, M., Stofkova, J., Stofkova, K. R., & Binasova, V. (2023). The use of the DEA method for measuring the efficiency of electronic public administration as part of the digitization of the economy and society. *Applied Sciences*, 13(6), 3672.
22. Latifah, L., Fatmawati, F., Ilham, I., & Gafur, A. (2023). Penerapan Sistem Kinerja Berbasis E-Kinerja Pada Pemerintahan Kota Bekasi. *Jurnal Administrasi Negara*, 29(1), 1–19.
23. Malodia, S., Dhir, A., Mishra, M., & Bhatti, Z. A. (2021). Future of e-Government: An integrated conceptual framework. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 173, 121102.
24. Mynenko, S. V., & Liulov, O. V. (2022). *The impact of digitalization on the transparency of public authorities*.
25. Onyango, G., & Ondiek, J. O. (2021). Digitalization and integration of sustainable development goals (SGDs) in public organizations in Kenya. *Public Organization Review*, 21(3), 511–526.
26. Plesner, U., & Justesen, L. (2022). The double darkness of digitalization: Shaping digital-ready legislation to reshape the conditions for public-sector digitalization. *Science, Technology, & Human Values*, 47(1), 146–173.
27. Scupola, A., & Mergel, I. (2022). Co-production in digital transformation of public administration and public value creation: The case of Denmark. *Government Information Quarterly*, 39(1), 101650.
28. Stoica, E., & Radu, L. (2023). The digitalization strategy of the public sector. *Challenges of the Knowledge Society*, 752–757.
29. Trischler, J., & Westman Trischler, J. (2022). Design for experience—a public service design approach in the age of digitalization. *Public Management Review*, 24(8), 1251–1270.
30. van Kersbergen, K., & Tinggaard Svendsen, G. (2024). Social trust and public digitalization. *AI & SOCIETY*, 39(3), 1201–1212.